

## **DILIGENCE PAYS 1/13/2016**

# **True Value Investing Still Works**

Value investing is on the ropes. At least, that's what you'd think reading <u>articles like this one</u> that highlight how "value" has underperformed "growth" in recent years. I put those words in quotes, partly because <u>the distinction</u> <u>between value and growth is somewhat arbitrary</u>, and also because the critics of value investing tend to attack metrics that have no real connection to shareholder value creation.

Patrick O'Shaughnessy did a great job of attacking this myth on his blog, <u>The Investor's Field Guide</u>. He points out that, over the last ten years, investors that have bought the cheapest stocks based on price to accounting book value have significantly underperformed. As we <u>recently pointed out</u>, book value relies upon flawed accounting metrics, diminishing its usefulness for investors.

Unfortunately, most of the "value" indexes that people reference, such as the Russell 3000 Value Index, are based primarily off of price to book. As O'Shaughnessy points out, the performance of value strategies varies greatly depending on which metric you use. If you picked the cheapest stocks based on earnings, you did poorly in 2015 but slightly overperformed over the last decade. Stocks with the cheapest price to sale ratios have done very well recently.

Despite their superior recent performance, these metrics have their own problems. We've pointed out many times how price to earnings ratios are <u>inherently flawed</u> and have almost no relationship with actual value. The sales number is at least less easy for executives to manipulate, but it also ignores structural margin differences and the impact of the balance sheet.

#### What's The Solution?

Investors looking for value need to take a holistic approach that measures a company's ability to deliver <a href="economic earnings">economic earnings</a> to investors and <a href="quantifies the expectations for future cash flows">quantifies the expectations for future cash flows</a> embedded in its current stock price.

This is what New Constructs aims to do, and while that process is not easy, it can be rewarding, as shown by the long-term outperformance of our strategies. As you can see from Figure 1, over the past decade our Most Attractive Large and Small Cap stocks have outperformed a combination of the S&P 500 and Russell 2000 by 80%.



Figure 1: Most Attractive Stocks Outperform

Sources: New Constructs, LLC and company filings.



# **DILIGENCE PAYS 1/13/2016**

The diligence we do helps us to uncover hidden gems that might not show up in simplistic, traditional value screens, such as computer chip manufacturer NVIDIA (NVDA). When we <u>highlighted NVDA as a long idea</u> in September, it had a P/E of 24 and a P/B of 3. Hardly numbers that are going to make your "average" value investor salivate.

However, a closer look showed that these numbers were misleading. For one, NVDA's reported income was artificially depressed by a \$60 million write-down hidden in the footnotes. Plus, the company earns a fantastic return on invested capital (ROIC) of 34%, demonstrating its competitive advantage and its ability to efficiently allocate capital.

After making adjustments to determine the true earnings quality and quantifying the market's expectations for future cash flows, we saw that NVDA had a price to economic book value (PEBV) of just 1.1, implying that the market believed the company would only grow after tax operating profit (NOPAT) by 10% for the remainder of its corporate life. For a company that had just doubled its NOPAT the year before, those expectations seemed awfully low.

Sure enough, the market has adjusted its expectations for NVDA in the past few months, driving the stock up 25% even as the S&P 500 has fallen by 2%. When the markets get volatile, it's the real value stocks, the ones with economic profits and low market expectations, that thrive. Meanwhile, the imposters get exposed.

### **Avoiding Value Traps and Imposters**

Succeeding in a struggling market is as much about avoiding the bad stocks as it is about picking the good ones. Our research helps clients avoid "value traps" that seem like they might be cheap on the surface but are actually significantly overvalued when you look a little closer.

One such value trap we warned investors about was Olin Corporation (OLN) back in June of 2014. The stock had a P/E of 13 and a P/B of 2 at the time, but those numbers were highly misleading. Hidden non-operating items boosted its reported earnings by \$25 million.

Plus, the company was facing obvious headwinds in the form of falling commodity prices for its chemicals division and an unsustainably high level of demand for its Winchester ammunition segment. Despite this fact, the market was expecting that OLN grow NOPAT by 5.5% for 35 years, an unrealistically long timeframe for such a weak and highly commoditized business.

OLN was able to coast by on its inflated accounting earnings when the market was strong, but that all changed after the S&P 500 hit its peak in the spring of 2015. Since then, the stock's been in free fall, and it's now down 42% from when we made our Danger Zone call.

Investors that pick stocks like OLN and ignore ones like NVDA due to simplistic metrics are not truly value investors. In a buyer-beware system like our market, you need to understand how to separate real value-investing research from the imposters. True value investing means performing your due diligence to understand the real economics of the underlying business and the profits it will have to achieve in the future to justify its stock price. Only by doing this hard work can investors uncover value and protect their portfolio.

Disclosure: David Trainer and Sam McBride receive no compensation to write about any specific stock, sector, style, or theme.



## New Constructs® - Profile

### How New Constructs Creates Value for Clients

We find it. You benefit. Cutting-edge technology enables us to scale our <u>forensic accounting</u> <u>expertise</u> across 3000+ stocks. We shine a light in the dark corners of SEC filings so our clients can make safer, more informed decisions.

Our <u>stock rating methodology</u> instantly informs you of the quality of the business and the fairness of the stock's valuation. We do the diligence on earnings quality and valuation so you don't have to.

In-depth risk/reward analysis underpins our ratings. Our rating methodology grades every stock, ETF, and mutual fund according to what we believe are the 5 most important criteria for assessing the quality of an equity. Each grade reflects the balance of potential risk and reward of buying that equity. Our analysis results in the 5 ratings described below. Very Attractive and Attractive correspond to a "Buy" rating, Very Dangerous and Dangerous correspond to a "Sell" rating, while Neutral corresponds to a "Hold" rating.

QUESTION: Why shouldn't fund research be as good as stock research? Why should fund investors rely on backward-looking price trends?

ANSWER: They should not.

Don't judge a fund by its cover. Take a look inside at its holdings and understand the quality of earnings and valuation of the stocks it holds. We enable you to choose the best fund based on its stock-picking merits so you do not have to rely solely on backward-looking technical metrics.

The drivers of our <u>forward-looking fund ratings</u> are Portfolio Management (i.e. the aggregated ratings of its holdings) and Total Annual Costs. The Total Annual Costs Rating (<u>details here</u>) captures the all-in cost of being in a fund over a 3-year holding period, the average period for all fund investors.

### Our Philosophy About Research

Accounting data is not designed for equity investors, but for debt investors. Accounting data must be translated into economic earnings to understand the profitability and valuation relevant to equity investors. Respected investors (e.g. Adam Smith, Warren Buffett and Ben Graham) have repeatedly emphasized that accounting results should not be used to value stocks. Economic earnings are what matter because they are:

- 1. Based on the complete set of financial information available.
- 2. Standard for all companies.
- 3. A more accurate representation of the true underlying cash flows of the business.

#### Additional Information

Incorporated in July 2002, New Constructs is an independent publisher of investment research that provides clients with consulting and research services. We specialize in quality-of-earnings, forensic accounting and discounted cash flow valuation analyses for all U.S. public companies. We translate accounting data from 10Ks into economic financial statements, i.e. NOPAT, Invested Capital, and WACC, to create economic earnings models, which are necessary to understand the true profitability and valuation of companies. Visit the Free Archive to download samples of our research. New Constructs is a BBB accredited business and a member of the Investorside Research Association.



## DILIGENCE PAYS 1/13/2016

### **DISCLOSURES**

New Constructs®, LLC (together with any subsidiaries and/or affiliates, "New Constructs") is an independent organization with no management ties to the companies it covers. None of the members of New Constructs' management team or the management team of any New Constructs' affiliate holds a seat on the Board of Directors of any of the companies New Constructs covers. New Constructs does not perform any investment or merchant banking functions and does not operate a trading desk.

New Constructs' Stock Ownership Policy prevents any of its employees or managers from engaging in Insider Trading and restricts any trading whereby an employee may exploit inside information regarding our stock research. In addition, employees and managers of the company are bound by a code of ethics that restricts them from purchasing or selling a security that they know or should have known was under consideration for inclusion in a New Constructs report nor may they purchase or sell a security for the first 15 days after New Constructs issues a report on that security.

### **DISCLAIMERS**

The information and opinions presented in this report are provided to you for information purposes only and are not to be used or considered as an offer or solicitation of an offer to buy or sell securities or other financial instruments. New Constructs has not taken any steps to ensure that the securities referred to in this report are suitable for any particular investor and nothing in this report constitutes investment, legal, accounting or tax advice. This report includes general information that does not take into account your individual circumstance, financial situation or needs, nor does it represent a personal recommendation to you. The investments or services contained or referred to in this report may not be suitable for you and it is recommended that you consult an independent investment advisor if you are in doubt about any such investments or investment services.

Information and opinions presented in this report have been obtained or derived from sources believed by New Constructs to be reliable, but New Constructs makes no representation as to their accuracy, authority, usefulness, reliability, timeliness or completeness. New Constructs accepts no liability for loss arising from the use of the information presented in this report, and New Constructs makes no warranty as to results that may be obtained from the information presented in this report. Past performance should not be taken as an indication or guarantee of future performance, and no representation or warranty, express or implied, is made regarding future performance. Information and opinions contained in this report reflect a judgment at its original date of publication by New Constructs and are subject to change without notice. New Constructs may have issued, and may in the future issue, other reports that are inconsistent with, and reach different conclusions from, the information presented in this report. Those reports reflect the different assumptions, views and analytical methods of the analysts who prepared them and New Constructs is under no obligation to insure that such other reports are brought to the attention of any recipient of this report.

New Constructs' reports are intended for distribution to its professional and institutional investor customers. Recipients who are not professionals or institutional investor customers of New Constructs should seek the advice of their independent financial advisor prior to making any investment decision or for any necessary explanation of its contents.

This report is not directed to, or intended for distribution to or use by, any person or entity who is a citizen or resident of or located in any locality, state, country or jurisdiction where such distribution, publication, availability or use would be contrary to law or regulation or which would be subject New Constructs to any registration or licensing requirement within such jurisdiction.

This report may provide the addresses of websites. Except to the extent to which the report refers to New Constructs own website material, New Constructs has not reviewed the linked site and takes no responsibility for the content therein. Such address or hyperlink (including addresses or hyperlinks to New Constructs own website material) is provided solely for your convenience and the information and content of the linked site do not in any way form part of this report. Accessing such websites or following such hyperlink through this report shall be at your own risk

All material in this report is the property of, and under copyright, of New Constructs. None of the contents, nor any copy of it, may be altered in any way, copied, or distributed or transmitted to any other party without the prior express written consent of New Constructs. All trademarks, service marks and logos used in this report are trademarks or service marks or registered trademarks or service marks of New Constructs.

Copyright New Constructs, LLC 2003 through the present date. All rights reserved.